

Delegated Decision

Sign off Sheet

Ref. No:	DM/24/2866	Case Officer:	Katherine Williams
Application Type:	Listed Building Consent		
Proposal:	Proposed alterations to rear extension of the Friary previously abutting former Dumbrells. Proposed incorporation of remaining former Dumbrells into Somners with new internal doorways for access. Proposed replacement single storey dwelling (Dumbrells) and associated landscape works		
Site:	Dumbrells, Church Platt, Somners And The Friary, South Street, Cuckfield, Haywards Heath, West Sussex, , ,		
Validation Date	17 Dec 2024	Overall Expiry Date:	11 Mar 2025
Pre-Commencement Conditions Required:		Pre-Com Conditions Date Agreed:	
Recommendation:	Permission	Recommendation Date:	23 Apr 2025
Target Date:	11 Feb 2025	Recommending Officer Signature:	Katherine Williams

Date Legal Agreement Completed: (if applicable)		No of Representations:	0
--	--	-------------------------------	---

Signed and Agreed By:	Steven King	Date:	24 Apr 2025
Comments:			

MID SUSSEX DISTRICT COUNCIL

DM/24/2866

Dumbrells, Church Platt, Somners And The Friary, South Street, Cuckfield, Haywards Heath, West Sussex, ,

Proposed alterations to rear extension of the Friary previously abutting former Dumbrells. Proposed incorporation of remaining former Dumbrells into Somners with new internal doorways for access. Proposed replacement single storey dwelling (Dumbrells) and associated landscape works

Mr David Thackeray

LETTERS OF REPRESENTATION

None received

SUMMARY OF CONSULTEES

Conservation Officer - No objection following amendments, recommend conditions

Historic England - No comment

PARISH COUNCIL OBSERVATIONS

No objection

INTRODUCTION

The application seeks listed building consent for alterations to the rear extension of the Friary previously abutting former Dumbrells. Proposed incorporation of remaining former Dumbrells into Somners with new internal doorways for access. Proposed replacement single storey dwelling (Dumbrells) and associated landscape works.

RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

CU/223/81 - Erect detached garage and access onto Church Platt. Granted

CU/15/88 - Garage. Granted

CU/017/92 - Garden building to be used as a study. Granted

14/02192/FUL - Replace existing corrugated iron exterior and enhance insulation. The roof to be replaced with decra style roofing tiles. The first floor facade of corrugated iron to be replaced by insulated render boards. Installation of enhanced insulation within the timber frame. Granted

DM/15/0160 - Replace corrugated iron roof with Decra tiling. Replace corrugated iron first floor facade with wooden weatherboards enhancing insulation in the timber frame. This is an amendment to planning permission 14/02192/FUL. Granted

DM/18/3863 - Proposed modification and extension of existing dwelling to include removal of two outbuilding and an existing garage (in part) to form modified existing vehicle access and detached garage building and workshop building. (Amended plans and description 10/12/2018). Granted

DM/21/3938 - Variation of condition no 2 relating to planning application DM/18/3863 - to allow for revised plans to amend the design of the extensions and modifications to the dwelling. (Amended plans received 17.06.2022). Granted

DM/21/3940 - Demolition of existing dwelling and various out buildings/existing garage and provision of new replacement 3no bedroom dwelling and detached double garage and shed. Additional plans and reports received 29/11/2021 and 6/12/2021. Withdrawn

DM/24/2865 - Proposed alterations to rear extension of the Friary previously abutting former Dumbrells. Proposed incorporation of remaining former Dumbrells into Somners with new internal doorways for access. Proposed replacement single storey dwelling (Dumbrells) and associated landscape works. Under Consideration

SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

The application site consists of three connected residential properties within the built up area and Conservation Area of Cuckfield. The properties are also within an Archaeological Notification Area and

within the setting of a number of listed buildings, including The Old School a Grade II school building, the Grade II White Harte pub and the Grade I Holy Trinity Church.

Two of the properties within the application site, Somners and The Friary face onto the eastern side of South Street, both properties are Grade II listed and have double frontage appearance onto the highway with coloured render frontages. Somners benefits from off street parking on South Street, with The Friary benefiting from off street parking to the rear of the property off Church Platt, a cul-de-sac to the south.

The rear property, Dumbrells, is not listed however adjoins onto both listed buildings with its amenity space to the east. This property has previously been granted planning permission for extensions and alterations which has been commenced but not completed.

The relationship of the application properties with the surrounding buildings results in the dwellings being visible from South Street, Church Platt and from The Old School and across the church yard of Holy Trinity.

The dwellings are constructed in render, brickwork, timber framing, plain roof tiles, with white timber fenestration.

APPLICATION DETAILS

The proposal seeks to incorporate the remaining two storey portion of Dumbrells into Somners to create a living room and additional bedroom for the dwelling with new internal access and fenestration. This projection would be constructed in a brick and stonework plinth, timber cladding, plain roof tiles and timber fenestration. The proposal also includes the demolition of the existing W.C projection which formed part of Dumbrells, with alterations to the roof of the Entrance Hall of The Friary with a front pitched roof and rear flat roof.

These works would also result in enlarged rear amenity space for Somners and The Friary with a new brick wall boundary between the properties and rear boundary hedging.

Dumbrells would be replaced by a new detached single storey dwelling within the remaining garden of the property. The dwelling would consist of a 1-bed 2-person 'L' dwelling positioned along the north and west boundaries of the site with front amenity space and parking area utilising the existing access for the property. The proposed dwelling would have pitched roof forms with gable ends, this would have an overall height and eaves height of some 5 metres and 2.5 metres. The dwelling would be constructed in brickwork, plain roof tiles, aluminium fenestration and timber louvre shutters.

LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND LIST OF POLICIES

Planning legislation holds that the determination of a planning application shall be made in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Using this as the starting point the development plan for this part of Mid Sussex consists of the District Plan, Site Allocations Development Plan Document (DPD) and the Cuckfield Neighbourhood Plan.

DISTRICT PLAN (adopted March 2018)

Relevant policies:

DP34 - Listed Buildings and Other Heritage Assets

Site Allocations DPD

The SADPD was adopted on 29th June 2022. It allocates sufficient housing and employment land to meet identified needs to 2031.

Cuckfield Neighbourhood Plan (made October 2014)

No relevant policies

Mid Sussex Site Allocations Document (DPD)

Mid Sussex District Council adopted its Site Allocations Development Plan Document on 29th June 2022. The Site Allocations DPD identifies sufficient housing sites to provide a five year housing land supply to 2031 and also makes sure that enough land is allocated to meet identified employment needs.

There are no policies deemed relevant to this application.

Other Legislation

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

Other Material Considerations

Mid Sussex District Plan 2021 - 2039 - Submission Draft (Regulation 19)

The District Council is reviewing and updating the District Plan. Upon adoption, the new District Plan 2021 - 2039 will replace the current District Plan 2014-2031 and its policies will have full weight. In accordance with the NPPF, Local Planning Authorities may give weight to relevant policies of the emerging plan according to the stage of preparation; the extent to which there are unresolved objections to the relevant policies; and the degree of consistency of the relevant policies in the emerging plan to the NPPF. The draft District Plan 2021-2039 (Regulation 19) is currently at Examination and stage 1 hearings were concluded on the 31st October 2024. There are unresolved objections to the majority of Policies in the draft District Plan and as such, only minimal weight can be given to the Plan and this planning application has been assessed against the policies of the adopted District Plan.

Relevant policies:

DPB2 - Listed Buildings and Other Heritage Assets

Mid Sussex Design Guide Supplementary Planning Document (SPD)

The Council has adopted a 'Mid Sussex Design Guide' SPD that aims to help deliver high quality development across the district that responds appropriately to its context and is inclusive and sustainable. The Design Guide was adopted by Council on 4th November 2020 as an SPD for use in the consideration and determination of planning applications. The SPD is a material consideration in the determination of planning applications.

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) (December 2024)

ASSESSMENT

The LPA is under a duty by virtue of s.16(2) of the Listed Building and Conservation Area (LBCA) Act 1990 (Decision on application): *'In considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.'*

The NPPF states that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation.

Policy DP34 of the District Plan is relevant and states:

'Development will be required to protect listed buildings and their settings. This will be achieved by ensuring that:

- *A thorough understanding of the significance of the listed building and its setting has been demonstrated. This will be proportionate to the importance of the building and potential impact of the proposal;*

- Alterations or extensions to a listed building respect its historic form, scale, setting, significance and fabric. Proposals for the conversion or change of use of a listed building retain its significance and character whilst ensuring that the building remains in a viable use;
- Traditional building materials and construction techniques are normally used. The installation of uPVC windows and doors will not be acceptable;
- Satellite antennae, solar panels or other renewable energy installations are not sited in a prominent location, and where possible within the curtilage rather than on the building itself;
- Special regard is given to protecting the setting of a listed building;
- Where the historic fabric of a building may be affected by alterations or other proposals, the applicant is expected to fund the recording or exploratory opening up of historic fabric.'

Paras 205, 212-215 of the NPPF state:

'205. In determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:

- a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;*
- b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and*
- c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.*

212. When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.

213. Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification. Substantial harm to or loss of:

- a) grade II listed buildings, or grade II registered parks or gardens, should be exceptional;*
- b) assets of the highest significance, notably scheduled monuments, protected wreck sites, registered battlefields, grade I and II* listed buildings, grade I and II* registered parks and gardens, and World Heritage Sites, should be wholly exceptional.*

214. Where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to (or total loss of significance of) a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or total loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss, or all of the following apply:

- a) the nature of the heritage asset prevents all reasonable uses of the site; and*
- b) no viable use of the heritage asset itself can be found in the medium term through appropriate marketing that will enable its conservation; and*
- c) conservation by grant-funding or some form of not for profit, charitable or public ownership is demonstrably not possible; and*
- d) the harm or loss is outweighed by the benefit of bringing the site back into use.*

215. Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.'

Principle DG11 of the Mid Sussex Design Guide states: *'Heritage assets and historic landscapes should be celebrated, enhanced and preserved where appropriate, for the enjoyment of existing and future residents. Where appropriate and providing it does not cause harm to the heritage assets or their setting, they should be carefully integrated into development proposals as they help to reinforce a sense of place and local identity.*

Elsewhere new development should generally reflect the scale of adjacent areas and the settlement context within which it is located to deliver a coherent and consistent urban fabric.

There may be potential to introduce a new character / development form and massing (refer to chapter 5):

- On larger urban extensions; this will typically be within the middle of the site and associated with a new neighbourhood centre, spine road or the main open space.

- In town centre locations defined as coarse grain areas and nearby sites identified on the brownfield sites register.'

Historic England has been consulted on the application and state that they do not wish to provide comments on the application.

The Council's Conservation Officer has provided the following comments on the application:

'The application site, Dumbrells, is attached to the rear of a pair of listed buildings, Somners and the Friary, which front onto South Street within the Cuckfield Conservation Area. The site is also within the setting of several other adjacent listed buildings, including Grade I listed Holy Trinity Church which is a short distance to the rear across Church Platt, The Grade II listed Old School, just to the north of the Church, and The White Harte Inn adjacent to the south on South Street, which is also Grade II listed.

The significance of the site, in respect of Dumbrells and its gardens, has been considered in the context of other proposals, and can be summarised as follows:

- The presence within the retained north wing at Dumbrells of historic fabric which was formerly part of a rear wing to Somners which as well as being of some age and interest in its own right also contributes positively to the understanding of the sequential development of Somners and its narrative. More detail on this can be found in the Heritage Statement submitted with the current application.*
- The positive contribution which the open and verdant gardens to Dumbrells make to the settings of Somners and the Friary, and to the character and appearance of the Cuckfield Conservation Area, including views from the east from the direction of the Old School (Grade II listed) and Holy Trinity Church (Grade I listed) and its churchyard, which also contains a number of listed lychgates and monuments.*

The site has a complex recent planning history including permission granted for alteration and extension of the existing house, with replacement of existing outbuildings with a detached garage and alterations to the access (DM/18/3863, modified by DM/21/3938), and withdrawal of an application for demolition of the existing dwelling and outbuildings and construction of a replacement detached 3 bedroom house, following adverse Officer comments including in respect of the scale and design of the detached house, and its impact on the settings of adjacent listed buildings and the Conservation Area (DM/21/3940). Pre-application advice has also been sought. Work has been commenced in respect of the approved scheme, and part of the previous building at Dumbrells has been removed, although the north wing (containing the historic timber framing) has been retained.

The current proposal is for alterations to the rear extension of the Friary previously abutting the former Dumbrells, incorporation of the remaining structure of the former Dumbrells into Somners, with new internal doorways for access, and a proposed replacement single storey dwelling within the former rear garden to Dumbrells, with associated hard and soft landscaping works, including vehicle access and parking.

The principle of development of this type was considered under a recent pre-application enquiry (DM/22/2672) and was considered acceptable, although concerns were raised at that time regarding the scale and design of the replacement dwelling within the rear garden area, which did not outweigh the heritage benefits of 'reuniting' the historic fabric isolated within the retained north wing of Dumbrells with the contiguous fabric within Somners. The current application attempts to address these concerns. To consider the key elements of the proposals in turn:

Work to Somners, The Friary, and the retained portion of Dumbrells:

A key element of the current proposal is the incorporation of the retained north wing of Dumbrells as a rear 'extension' to Somners, with the creation of new doorways at ground and first floor. This will result in the loss of some historic masonry due to the creation of the doorways. However on balance the benefits

of reuniting the surviving exposed historic framing to the northern elevation of the rear wing with the contiguous fabric within Somners, so that the entirety of the surviving framing can be appreciated within the one property, is considered to outweigh this minor harm.

Adjacent to the south elevation of the rear wing of Somners, it is proposed to remove a catslide roof above a rear extension to The Friary which has been installed above an earlier pitched and flat roof combination, exposing this earlier roof structure and also more of the original elevation of the building at first floor. This 'layering' of roof structures was observed during a previous site visit. As this removes later fabric in favour of an earlier arrangement, and also exposes more of the original elevation of the listed buildings at first floor, this aspect of the proposal is not considered contentious.

The removal of a more modern WC extension is likewise not considered contentious.

The proposed south elevation also shows a new window to the side of the rear wing to the rear of Somners. This may be acceptable subject to further information on the impact on the historic fabric of the building, both the timber frame and infill. Likewise the new rooflights proposed to either side of the retained north wing to Dumbrells may be acceptable subject to confirmation that there is no adverse impact on any historic fabric which may survive within the roof structure.

The proposal also includes alterations to the elevations of the north wing, including changes to the fenestration. These are considered generally acceptable in the context, although I have some concerns regarding the scale of the windows proposed at ground and first floor to the east elevation facing over The Platt. In my opinion, these may appear overly prominent in the context of the existing more modestly scaled fenestration to the adjacent listed buildings. I would recommend this aspect is reconsidered.

Proposed new dwelling within the rear garden:

The proposal includes a one bedroom dwelling within the rear garden which is intended as a replacement for Dumbrells. As noted above, the principle of development of this nature was considered at pre-application stage and found to be acceptable, on balance, in heritage terms given the beneficial impact of the scheme in respect of the significance of Somners. The footprint, form and design of the dwelling have been amended following negative Officer comments on the previous scheme; the revised design is considered much more sympathetic to the context, although further details will be required of some aspects including the proposed materials, which include solar PV slates to elevations facing over the Platt. We would need to be reassured that the use of these slates on more visually prominent roofslopes is appropriate. This information could be secured by condition.

Hard and soft landscaping scheme:

As noted above, a key aspect of the significance of the site at Dumbrells is the relatively open and verdant character of the rear garden. Whilst as above the built form of the proposed new dwelling is balanced to an extent by the removal of existing outbuildings and the partial demolition of Dumbrells itself, the extent of development within the rear garden remains of concern, and the extent of any associated hardsurfacing should be kept to an absolute minimum. I would recommend that this aspect of the proposal is revisited and that wherever possible hard surfacing is replaced by soft landscaping, or as a second choice, Grasscrete or similar.

On balance, therefore, the proposal is considered acceptable in principle in heritage terms. The proposed works to the retained portion of Dumbrells with Somners will be beneficial to the significance of the latter listed building. This benefit stands to be weighed against the potential harm caused by the new dwelling within the rear garden, which must also be considered in the context of the removal of part of the built form of Dumbrells and of existing outbuildings within the gardens, as well as the existing permission to extend to the rear of Dumbrells.

Revisions are however required to some aspects of the scheme, as set out above, and various details will be required by condition should permission in due course be granted.'

Following these comments amended plans were provided and the following additional comments were provided.

'Further comments on the above application following the receipt of revised plans.

- *The scale and form of the fenestration to the rear elevation of the retained portion of Dumbrells have been amended so that the windows as shown now relate better to the context. This aspect of the proposal is now not considered contentious.*
- *As far as I can see we have no further detail of the proposed rooflights to Dumbrells or their impact on the roof structure?*
- *The proposed landscaping scheme has been revised to reduce the extent of the proposed hard landscaping in favour of more soft landscaping. On balance, this aspect of the proposal is now also considered acceptable.*

Subject to the further information required relating to the rooflights, the proposal is therefore now considered to preserve the special interests of Somners and the Friary and the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, including the settings of the listed buildings to the rear. This meets the requirements of District Plan Policies DP34 and DP35 and the relevant paragraphs of the NPPF.

I would suggest the following conditions:

- *Details of facing and roofing materials*
- *Detailed hard and soft landscaping scheme including details of surfacing materials and of any new or altered fences, walls and gates.*
- *Details of the PV slates to the new dwelling, including manufacturer's specification and detailed sectional drawings to show the slates in context of the surrounding roofslope*
- *Detailed drawings, at an appropriate large scale, including sections and annotated to show materials and finishes, of the following:*
 - *Typical examples of windows and external doors. Your drawings should include as appropriate sectional details of reveals and of glazing bars.*
 - *Typical eaves sections*
- *Rainwater goods to be of painted metal*
- *Rooflights to be flush fitting, metal framed conservation style rooflights'*

Confirmation was subsequently received that the rooflights in question are already in place and are situated in the newly built roof structure of Dumbrells and are not above the rafters and within the roof structure.

The proposal would be seen within the context of the existing village centre of Cuckfield and the surrounding residential properties, which maintains the character of the area. The proposed replacement dwelling is considered to be of an appropriate to the locality and would be of a simple contemporary design with a low profile. The incorporation of the existing built form of Dumbrells into Somners along with alterations to both listed buildings and enlargements of their curtilages would not have a harmful impact upon the special interest of the listed building.

CONCLUSION

The special interest of the building will therefore be preserved by the works. As a result, the proposal complies with policy DP34 of the District Plan, as well as the requirements of both the NPPF and the Listed Building and Conservation Area (LBCA) Act 1990.

Decision: Permission

Case Officer: Katherine Williams